# CALIFORNIA STATE PERSONNEL BOARD MEETING 801 Capitol Mall Sacramento, California

www.spb.ca.gov

<u>Public Session Location</u> - Room 150 Closed Session Location - Room 141

# FULL BOARD MEETING MINUTES

MAY 2, 2000

# PUBLIC SESSION OF THE STATE PERSONNEL BOARD

1. ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Florence Bos, President Ron Alvarado, Vice President Richard Carpenter, Member William Elkins, Member Sean Harrigan, Member

2. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER - Walter Vaughn

The Board was advised of the following:

- A. The State Personnel Board's budget is scheduled for consideration in the Assembly on May 10, 2000.
- 3. REPORT OF THE CHIEF COUNSEL Elise Rose

The Chief Counsel reported on:

A. <u>Alexander v. State Personnel Board</u> - Oral argument was presented to the Court of Appeal on April 18, 2000. We have not yet received the decision.

4. REPORT ON LEGISLATION - Judy Balmain

The Board was advised of the following:

A. SB 2025 (Burton) - The Board sponsored bill passed out of the Senate Appropriations Committee.

The State Personnel Board voted on the following:

A. SB 2009 (Solis) as introduced; would force state agencies, including the State Personnel Board to forego their right to appeal a Superior Court decision if that decision was rendered in favor of a state employee and was from an appeal of an adverse action against the employee or a discrimination claim by an employee. Employees would retain their right to appeal any adverse Superior Court decision.

ACTION: Oppose

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

B. SB 2027 (Sher) as introduced; this bill would permit a person whose request for public records is denied, to appeal to the Attorney General and obtain a written opinion. Permits that person to sue in court without going to the Attorney General. Includes fines for non-compliance.

ACTION: Neutral

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

C. AB 2142 (Keeley) as amended April 4, 2000; this bill would broaden the Fair Employment and Housing definition of Sex to include gender.

ACTION: Neutral

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

D. AB 2222 (Kuehl) as amended April 5, 2000; the bill would amend California's Fair Employment and Housing Act, specific it would clarify the definitions of "mental disability," "physical disability," and "medical condition" it would redefine the phrase "major life activities."

ACTION: Neutral if Amended

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

E. AB 2701 (Jackson) as amended April 3, 2000; this bill makes various changes to the statute governing "fitness of duty examinations" revises the Confidentiality of Medical Information Act as it applies to medical examinations. Also includes some clarifying code changes.

ACTION: Neutral if Amended VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

F. SB 1419 (Haynes) as amended May 1, 2000; this bill deals with "medical profiling" and no longer impacts State Personnel Board.

ACTION: Change position from Oppose unless Amended to: No Position

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

#### 5. ORAL ARGUMENT

Oral argument in the matter of JAMES BLANCHARD, CASE NO. 99-3198. Appeal from constructive demotion. Department of Corrections.

Persons Participating:

Joel Levinson, Supervising Legal Counsel, California Correctional Peace Officers Association (CCPOA) representing appellant Laura D. Baumann, Staff Counsel, representing Department of Corrections ACTION: Submitted

6. ORAL ARGUMENT

Oral argument in the matter of NICHOLAS LEON, CASE NO. 98-3392. Appeal from 40-calendar day suspension. Department of Corrections.

Persons Participating:

Wendall Llopis, Attorney at Law, representing appellant Chuck Maurer, Employee Relations Officer, representing Department of Corrections

ACTION: Submitted

7. ORAL ARGUMENT

Oral argument in the matter of SANDRA JOHNSON, CASE NO. 99-1256. Appeal from demotion. Department of Corrections.

ACTION: Withdrawn and rescheduled for June 6, 2000.

8. TECHNICAL TRAINING PROGRAM'S SELECTION ANALYST CERTIFICATES PRESENTATION

ACTION: Awards presented

9. HEARING - APPEAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF OPERATING ENGINEERS (IUOE) FROM THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S APPROVAL OF CALIFORNIA SCIENCE CENTER'S (CSC) COST-SAVINGS CONTRACT FOR EXPOSITION PARK GROUNDS MAINTENANCE PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 19130 (a).

Persons Participating:

Adam N. Stern, Attorney at Law, Levy, Stern & Ford, representing IUOE
Dennis Hutcheson, Deputy Director, Administration, California Science Center

ACTION: Submitted

10. HEARING - THE DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENTAL SERVICES PROPOSES TO ESTABLISH THE SERIES SPECIFICATION FOR BEHAVIOR SPECIALIST AND ESTABLISH THE CLASSES OF BEHAVIOR

# Minutes - Page 5 May 2, 2000

SPECIALIST I AND BEHAVIOR SPECIALIST II EACH WITH A 12-MONTH PROBATIONARY PERIOD AND TO DESIGNATE THEM AS SENSITIVE FOR THE PURPOSE OF PRE-EMPLOYMENT DRUG TESTING.

ACTION: Withdrawn

# **BOARD ACTIONS**

11. STATE PERSONNEL BOARD SUMMARY MINUTES OF APRIL 18, 2000

ACTION: Adopted on May 2, 2000.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

12. ACTION ON SUBMITTED ITEMS

ACTION: See page 14

13. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE CASES

On May 2, 2000, the Board adopted the following decisions presented by Elise Rose, Chief Counsel, California State Personnel Board.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

#### PETITIONS GRANTED

JANET G. HOUCHENS, CASE NO. 99-0891 Appeal from 5 percent reduction in salary for 1 month Department of Forestry and Fire Protection ACTION: Submitted

SYLVIA C. SOLIS, CASE NO. 99-0574 Appeal from medical termination Department of Motor Vehicles ACTION: Submitted

# REJECTED AND REMANDED DECISION

ROBERT H. TRIMBLE, CASE NO. 97-4115

Appeal from 45 day's suspension

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Board adopted findings of fact but the penalty is modified to an official reprimand

Minutes - Page 6 May 2, 2000

MICHAEL N. LE, CASE NO. 99-0246
Appeal from 10 working day's suspension
Employment Development Department
ACTION: Board denied appellant's request for order to show cause

SPENCER SILVERBACH, CASE NO. 98-0743

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Board denied appellant's "petition to vacate decision, rescind stipulation and set case for hearing"

WARD SHELTON, CASE NO. 98-0319
MICHAEL CROMBIE, CASE NO. 98-0380
Appeal from 30-calendar day's suspension
Department of Corrections
ACTION: Board approves stipulation for settlement and vacates its decision

# PROPOSED DECISIONS

STEPHANIE T. LAAM, CASE NO. 00-0340
Appeal from dismissal
Department of Corrections
ACTION: Administrative Law Judge's proposed decision rejected by Board. Board to decide case itself

MIGUEL A. PLATERO, CASE NO. 99-2612
Appeal from 180-calendar day's suspension
Department of Corrections
ACTION: 180-calendar day's suspension modified to 10
working days suspension

MICHAEL RUSHIN, CASE NO. 99-3582

Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 6 months

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Reduction in salary sustained

ELISA A. MARTINEZ, CASE NO. 99-4030
Petition for accommodation for disability
Department of Food and Agriculture
ACTION: Petition for accommodation for disability denied

ROBERTA ESFANDIARFARD, CASE NO. 99-2792

Minutes - Page 7 May 2, 2000

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Mental Health

ACTION: Board adopted findings of fact, but modified

dismissal to 3-month suspension

MOSES TURAY, CASE NO. 99-3330

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Developmental Services

ACTION: Dismissal revoked

CAMERON LOGGINS, CASE NO. 99-4329

Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 2 months

Department of General Services

ACTION: Sustaining reduction in salary sustained

BARBARA A. NIOUS, CASE NO. 99-4833

Appeal from 10 percent reduction in Salary for 12 pay periods

Department of the Youth Authority

ACTION: Reduction in salary modified to 10 percent for 6 pay periods

ANGELINE PADILLA, CASE NO. 99-5247

Appeal from official reprimand

Department of Motor Vehicles

ACTION: Official reprimand sustained

LEON H. JOHNSON, CASE NO. 00-0018

Appeal from 60-calendar day's suspension

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Suspension revoked

VICTOR GARCIA, CASE NO. 99-4109

Appeal from official reprimand

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Official reprimand sustained

DIANE KING, CASE NO. 99-5003

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Developmental Services

ACTION: Dismissal modified to 6 months suspension

REGINAL SMITH, CASE NO. 00-0312

Appeal from 30-calendar day's suspension

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Administrative Law Judge's proposed decision

rejected by Board. Board to decide case itself

MARK LOVINGTON, CASE NO. 99-3202

Minutes - Page 8 May 2, 2000

Appeal from 30-calendar day's suspension Department of Housing and Community Development ACTION: Administrative Law Judge's proposed decision rejected by Board. Board to decide case itself

DENNIS VALENTINO, CASE NO. 99-4720
Appeal from denial of Service Based Salary Increase
California State University, Long Beach
ACTION: Determined the appeal dismissed for lack of jurisdiction

LYNN MARIE SMITH, CASE NO. 00-0049 Appeal from dismissal Human Services Agency, County of Merced ACTION: Dismissal sustained

ROGER VELA, CASE NO. 99-4826

Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 6 months

JAMES MATTINGLY, CASE NO. 99-4823

Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 12 months

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Reductions in salary revoked

WILLIAM SULLIVAN, CASE NO. 99-3904
Appeal from dismissal
Department of Corrections
ACTION: Administrative Law Judge's proposed decision
rejected by Board. Board to decide case itself

DEAN W. BEAMAN, CASE NO. 99-4970 Appeal from 5-days suspension Department of Social Services ACTION: Suspension sustained

# PETITIONS FOR REHEARING

ANNE EDWARDS, CASE NO. 99-1327 Appeal from dismissal Department of General Services

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by respondent denied

DAVID NUNEZ, CASE NO. 98-3145
Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 6 months
Department of Corrections
ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant

granted

Minutes - Page 9 May 2, 2000

DANIEL MONTANEZ, CASE NO. 99-0307

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by respondent denied

KAREN MABRY, CASE NO. 99-3207

Appeal from 30 days suspension

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

DONALD J. HEMANS, CASE NO. 99-1273

Appeal from 60 days suspension

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed appellant denied

AMOS NUGENT, CASE NO. 98-0608

Appeal from demotion

Board of Equalization

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

CHRISTOPHER RAMOS, CASE NO. 99-0458

Appeal from 5 percent reduction in Salary for 6 months

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant granted

LORITA SEATON, CASE NO. 99-0286

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

DON SENNER, CASE NO. 99-0502

Appeal from dismissal

Department of Corrections

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

HARVEY N. BILLS, CASE NO. 99-1326

Appeal from dismissal

Department of the Youth Authority

ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

HARRY C. BARRETT, CASE NO. 99-0234

# Minutes - Page 10 May 2, 2000

Appeal from 30 working days suspension
Department of Transportation
ACTION: Petition for rehearing filed by appellant denied

14. RESOLUTION RE NOTICE OF GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 18671.1 EXTENSION.

ACTION: See pages 15-17

15. MISCELLANEOUS APPEALS DIVISION CASES
(Discrimination Complaints, Withholds, Voided
Appointments, Rule 211 Appeals, Petitions for Rehearing)
On May 2, 2000, the Board adopted the following decisions
presented by Linda Brooks, Assistant Executive Officer,
California State Personnel Board.
VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

# PETITION FOR REHEARING

A. CHERYL BEARDO, Case No. 00-0412 Classification: Accounting Officer, (Specialist) ACTION: DENIED

# RULE 211; REQUEST TO TAKE CIVIL SERVICE EXAMINATION

B. EDWARD LOPEZ, Case No. 99-3894
Classification: Construction Supervisor II and
Construction Inspector I
ACTION: DENIED

# WITHHOLD FROM CERTIFICATION

C. GUSTAVO MUNOZ, Case No. 99-3648 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: GRANTED

D. ROGER D. HERNANDEZ, Case No. 99-3752
Classification: Hospital Peace Officer (HPO) I
ACTION: DENIED

# Minutes - Page 11 May 2, 2000

E. JEROME JUNIOR, Case No. 99-3573 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: DENIED

F. PATRICIA F. MACK, Case No. 99-4743
Classification: Parole Agent I, Adult Parole
ACTION: DENIED

G. RODOLFO MUNOZ, Case No. 99-3519 Classification: Hospital Peace Officer (HPO) I ACTION: DENIED

H. RACHELLE RAHIMI, Case No. 99-2956 Classification: Communications Operator ACTION: DENIED

I. SILVIA P. REYNA, Case No. 99-4914 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: DENIED

J. AMY RUBALCABA-RUDEN, Case No. 99-3042
Classification: Youth Correctional Officer
ACTION: DENIED

#### DISMISSAL CASES

K. VIRGINIA ARROYO, Case No. 00-0648 Classification: Psychiatric Technician ACTION: DISMISSED

L. DOUGLAS F. LANGE, Case No. 00-0372 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: DISMISSED

# 16. MEDICAL APPEALS

On May 2, 2000, the Board adopted the following decisions presented by Linda Brooks, Assistant Executive Officer, California State Personnel Board.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

# DISMISSAL CASE

A. GARY ZARATE, Case No. 99-2754 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: DISMISSED Minutes - Page 12 May 2, 2000

#### 17. EXAMINATION APPEALS

On May 2, 2000, the Board adopted the following decisions presented by Linda Brooks, Assistant Executive Officer, California State Personnel Board.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

# DISMISSAL CASE

A. ERIC WITZEL, Case No. 99-4755 Classification: Correctional Officer ACTION: DISMISSED

# 18. NON-HEARING CALENDAR

On May 2, 2000, the Board adopted item A. This item was presented by Laura Aguilera, Chief, Personnel Resources and Innovations Division, California State Personnel Board.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

A. DOROTHY RICE

Proposed equity resolution to allow Dorothy Rice to remain in the class of CEA 3.

- 19. CAREER EXECUTIVE ASSIGNMENT (CEA) CATEGORY ACTIVITY
  - A. REQUESTS TO ESTABLISH NEW CEA POSITIONS CURRENTLY UNDER CONSIDERATION
    - (1) DIRECTOR, CALIFORNIA SPECIALIZED TRAINING INSTITUTE

The Office of Emergency Services proposes to allocate the above position to the CEA category to have responsibility for the full range of activities of the California Specialized Training Institute in the development and presentation of educational programs for local, state and federal government representatives. The department indicates that the position will be at the third organizational level and will report to the Deputy Director, Emergency Operations Planning and Training Division.

(2) ASSISTANT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ADMINISTRATION

The San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission proposes to allocate the above position to the CEA category to be responsible for the administrative functions of the Commission including budgeting, accounting, personnel, business services, contracts, information technology and direct support to the Commission. The department indicates that the position will be at the second organizational level and will report to the Executive Director.

(3) DEPUTY DIRECTOR OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
The Department of Fair Employment and Housing
proposes to allocate the above position to the
CEA category to be responsible for establishing
and maintaining the administrative internal
policies and programs. The department indicates
that the position will be at the second
organizational level and will report to the
Director/Chief Deputy Director.

# (4) AGENCY INFORMATION OFFICERS (VARIOUS DEPARTMENTS)

The Department of Information Technology on behalf of the following agencies: Youth and Adult Correctional Agency, Trade and Commerce Agency, Health and Human Services Agency, California Environmental Protection Agency, Business, Transportation and Housing Agency, Office of Education, State and Consumer Services Agency and Resources Agency, proposes to allocate the above nine positions to the CEA category to ensure that information technology activities of the departments are developed and managed to meet the goals and standards of the agency and statewide enterprise requirements. The department indicates that these positions will be at the second organizational level and will report to the Agency Secretary.

- B. EXECUTIVE OFFICER DECISIONS REGARDING REQUESTS TO ESTABLISH NEW CEA POSITIONS
  - (1) DEPUTY DIRECTOR, SYSTEMS DIVISION

    The Department of Child Support Services'

    proposal to allocate the above position to the

    CEA category has been approved effective April
    3, 2000.

Minutes - Page 14 May 2, 2000

(2) ASSISTANT DIRECTOR, OFFICE OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SERVICES

The California Energy's Commission's proposal to allocate the above position to the CEA category has been disapproved effective April 10, 2000.

ACTION: Noted

ADJOURNMENT

#### SUBMITTED

1. EQUAL OPPORTUNITY GOALS FOR MINORITIES AND WOMEN (Hearing held February 9, 2000).

NO ACTION

2. MICHAEL A. THOMPSON, CASE NO. 98-3739. Appeal from dismissal. Department of Corrections. (Oral argument held March 7, 2000).

ACTION: On May 2, 2000, adopted Board decision modifying dismissal to 18-month suspension and demotion to Supervising Cook I with all back pay and interest and benefits, if any.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

3. ALLEN VIZARD, CASE NO. 99-3708. Appeal from 30-calendar day's suspension. Department of Corrections. (Oral argument held April 4, 2000).

ACTION: On May 2, 2000, adopted Board decision sustaining

30-calendar day suspension.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

4. THOMAS BENSON, CASE NO. 99-1386. Appeal from dismissal. Department of Corrections. (Oral argument held April 4, 2000).

ACTION: On May 2, 2000, adopted Board decision sustaining dismissal.

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

5. GAYLE MCCORMICK, CASE NO. 99-1549. Appeal from demotion. Department of Corrections. (Written argument presented April 4, 2000).

ACTION: On May 2, 2000, adopted Board decision revoking demotion.\*

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.

# Minutes - Page 16 May 2, 2000

\*Adopted as Precedential Decision(s) #'s 00-05. [NOTE: Precedential Decisions of the State Personnel Board are published and available by subscription from Continuing Education of the Bar (CEB) in Berkeley. To subscribe, call CEB, toll free, at (800) 924-3924.]

#### NOTICE OF GOVERNMENT CODE § 18671.1 RESOLUTION

Since Government Code section 18671.1 requires that cases pending

before State Personnel Board Administrative Law Judges (ALJ's) be completed within six months or no later than 90 days after submission of a case, whichever is first, absent the publication of substantial reasons for needing an additional forty-five days, the Board hereby publishes its substantial reasons for the need for the forty-five day extension for some of the cases now pending before it for decision.

An additional forty-five days may be required in cases that require multiple days of hearings, that have been delayed by unusual circumstances, or that involve any delay generated by either party (including, but not limited to, submission of written briefs, requests for settlement conferences, continuances, discovery disputes, pre-hearing motions). In such cases, six months may be inadequate for the ALJ to hear the entire case, prepare a proposed decision containing the detailed factual and legal analysis required by law, and for the State Personnel Board to review the decision and adopt, modify or reject the proposed decision within the time limitations of the statute.

Minutes - Page 18 May 2, 2000

Therefore, at its next meeting, the Board will issue the attached resolution extending the time limitation by 45 days for all cases that meet the above criteria, and that have been before the Board for less than 6 months as of the date of the Board meeting.

# GOVERNMENT CODE § 18671.1 RESOLUTION

WHEREAS, Section 18671.1 provides that, absent waiver by the appellant, the time period in which the Board must render its decision on a petition pending before it shall not exceed six months from the date the petition was filed or 90 days from the date of submission; and

WHEREAS, Section 18671.1 also provides for an extension of the time limitations by 45 additional days if the Board publishes substantial reasons for the need for the extension in its calendar prior to the conclusion of the six-month period; and

WHEREAS, the Agenda for the instant Board meeting included an item titled "Notice of Government Code § 18671.1 Resolution" which sets forth substantial reasons for utilizing that 45-day extension to extend the time to decide particular cases pending before the Board;

WHEREAS, there are currently pending before the Board cases that have required multiple days of hearing and/or that have been delayed by unusual circumstances or by acts or omissions of the parties themselves;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED AND ORDERED that the time limitations set forth in Government Code section 18671.1 are hereby extended an additional 45 days for all cases that have required multiple days of hearing or that have been delayed by acts or omissions of the parties or by unusual circumstances and that have been pending before the Board for less than six months as of the date this resolution is adopted.

Minutes - Page 20 May 2, 2000

\* \* \* \* \*

Minutes - Page 21 May 2, 2000

I hereby certify that the State Personnel Board made and adopted the preceding resolution at its meeting on May 2, 2000.

\_\_\_\_\_

WALTER VAUGHN Executive Officer California State Personnel Board

VOTE: Bos, Alvarado, Carpenter, Elkins, Harrigan - Aye.